

C.S.

PUBLIC WORKS. (Roads)
No. 76/38.

19 38.

H.E. the Governor. 19 38. 11th April. Previous Paper.	SUBJECT. <p style="text-align: center;"><u>Construction of tracks to the Camp :-</u></p> <p style="text-align: center;">His Excellency the Governor requests information regarding cost of, etc.</p>
--	---

MINUTES.

Minute from H.E. the Governor to Hon. Col. Sec. 7. 4. 38.

D.P. who.

Will you kindly furnish the information called for by H.E.

MCH

11. 4. 38

Hon; Col Sec,

The cost of the Tracks was as follows :-

- South Track. Common gate to Pony's Pass approximately £1672 per mile.
- North Track. Wireless Station to Two Sisters approximately £1584 per mile.
- Canopus Track. (not yet completed) £1408 per mile.

The distance from Pony's Pass to Fitzroy = 16 miles.

: : : Two Sisters gate to Tar Barrel Rincon, Estancia. = 11½ miles.

Subsequent Paper.

The cost of the extension of the North and South tracks under existing conditions would be £1640 per mile /made

made up as follows :-

1 mile of road, clear, hardcore, metal blind & drain.	£1584.
Bridge 1 stream, say one to each mile, 10 ft @ £1 ft	10

Provision for accomodation and plant.

Tractor, crusher and trailers.	£1000	} miles 27½ say 46 £1275
Portable Cook-house.	75	
: : Sleeping Quarters.	150	
: : Office & quarters for Ganger.	50	
	£1275	

Total per mile. £ 1640

You will understand that the cost of the work would largely depend on the supervision available, it is extremely doubtful whether a suitable independent ganger is available locally.

A. Roberts.
Director of Public Works.
29th April, 1938.

Mr. Submitted. Perhaps Mr. will wish to discuss this with Mr. Roberts this morning.
West
29. 4. 38

I have discussed this with the D.P.W. His experience of road making here and which constitutes him as far the best authority in the matter make his estimate incalculable. There has been in the past and continues to be a great deal of loose talk about the obligation on the Government of extending metalled roads. Mr. Roberts is emphatically of opinion that the work it is not an economical proposition from any point of view and I see no reason for

differ from him.

2. I propose to make out a reasoned case for the view at present taken by Government and to give critics such as Mr. George Bonner an opportunity of replying to it. We want to deal with hard facts in the place of any theoretical values.

3. Two matters require elucidation for the case to be prepared. It is alleged ~~that~~

(1) ~~that~~ That the estimates of cost ~~as~~ given herein are extravagant. Mr. Roberts has explained to me that some saving may be made at least might be made by obtaining the services of a foreign road firm from the U.K. There remains the further question of lighter construction. It is useless to talk about the value of roads for wheeled traffic unless they can carry over any period (with maintenance) a fair volume of traffic including lorries of not less than 3 tons weight. I am satisfied that the foundation and metalling over soft camp could

A

not be lighter than that already
employed. It is not shown in
258/32 that ribbon tracks were
found after full experience unobtainable
and that the centre ~~had to be~~ shown in photos
recep (1) and (2) is that pile had to be
filled in with metal. I would like some
~~more~~ ^{fuller information} from the D.T.W. on that subject
to be included in his report called for
by this minute.

(2) It is said further that though the
cost of carrying a metalled road through
soft camp may be £1600 a mile yet
the major portion of road making required
in this Clony would be in hard camp
where the cost would be very small. It
appears to be almost assumed that it is
sufficient to cut off the top sods and
make a motor road at a cost of some
such amount as a few pounds a mile. I
have motored over so called tracks where
this has been tried and am not only not
firmly impressed but am of the belief
that nothing but metalled roads with proper
foundations will afford the service required.
I will be glad if the D.T.W. will express
his opinion and will also estimate the
cost of road making over hard camp

TTTTT 2/6/38

Inside Minute Paper.

Director Public Works.

For your opinion and
 estimates please as required
 by H.C. the Government.

MCH
 2.6.58

Hon; Colonial Secretary.

With reference to His Excellency's minute dated the 2nd of June, 1938, regarding road making in the Falkland Islands, I beg to submit the following report :-

The estimates which I have given are based on 16 years experience in the Colony; the work which has so far been carried out has not been left to others; each section of road has received my personal attention.

I am satisfied that the figures which I have quoted are in no way extravagant, that is if the work is to be done properly. It is true that a saving of approximately £100 per mile might be saved by engaging an independent road ganger of the proper type, but it is questionable when taking into consideration the cost of salary, passages, etc, which would have to go against the cost of the work, whether it would be justified.

When discussing roads with some of the farmers it has been said :- "All that is required is a few lumps knocked off and a few holes filling, with a little drainage here and there so that a car can get over it". I submit that this is a fallacy; such statements can be entirely ignored. I have surveyed most of the usual routes to the farms on the East Falklands in a six-wheeler 30 cwt lorry fitted with creeper tracks, also in a specially constructed 24 H.P. Ford car fitted with over-size tyres and chains, and nowhere have I seen camp

/which

which when treated as suggested would allow a car to take the same wheel track more than about twice.

It is only the knitted roots of the grass in the top sod that holds the vehicle up, once this is broken and the same track is taken the vehicle will sink through the peat to the solid.

B | It has been said by many that when the top sod is only a foot or so deep one can make a good track by stripping this off and exposing the clay; this has been done on some of the farms and I have travelled over these tracks. From the experience gained I am of opinion that they are all right for a light vehicle when the weather conditions are favourable, but in bad weather or after rain (which is fairly frequent) they are a sorry job, they are greasy, full of ruts and potholes and would in no way be suitable for a lorry or heavy car traffic.

To make a road which will be of any use in the Colony, one ^{must} ~~would~~ wherever possible avoid deep peat banks. The site of the road should be sited where there is not more than a foot to one foot, six inches of peat, the top sod must be removed, the subsoil be well drained, and drainage trenches be cut on the high side of the land through which the road runs. A mattress of rock from eight to nine inches in thickness must be put on the clay, this should receive from three to four inches of broken stone or gravel, finally it should have a dressing of binding material such as can be found in clay banks along the track, and then be consolidated with a ton roller. After much consideration and experience I am convinced that this is the only practical method to adopt.

The cost of making such a road is approximately £1640 per mile. With regard to forming roads over hard camp it will first be necessary to define hard camp as follows :-

(a) Where clay is found within six inches of the surface.

(b) Where stone runs are encountered.

With regard to (a) such camp is not encountered until one leaves Stanley some 15 miles behind. Taking the usual camp tracks right through the East Falklands, I should say that a fair estimate would be 40% hard camp as defined at (a) and 10% stone run as defined at (b) there would on (a) be a saving of labour, in so far as it would not be necessary to excavate the top sod, but on such camp it would still be

/necessary

necessary to provide the foundation, metal, blinding and drainage.

In the case of (b) where stone runs are encountered there would also be a saving mostly on the transport of rock and labour in drain cutting, for here one could get natural drainage. The method to be adopted here would be to level the surface by breaking down the rocks and finishing off with shingle and blinding in the ordinary way. I estimate the saving per mile to be as follows :-

In the case of (a)

1760 yds x 4 yds x $\frac{1}{3}$ yd, = 2347 cu yds.

less work excavating & clearing
at 1/- per yard. = £117. 7. 0

making the estimated cost of

road over hard camp (a) = £1522. 13. 0

instead of £1640. 0. 0

In the case of (b)

1760 yds x 4 yds x $\frac{1}{4}$ yd = 1760 cu yds.

less work in transporting rock

and drainage valued at say 5/-

per cu yd. = £440. 0. 0

making the estimated cost of

road through stone runs (b) = £1200. 0. 0

instead of £1640. 0. 0

Taking as an example the $27\frac{1}{2}$ miles which is the ^{remaining} distance from Stanley to Fitzroy and the Estancia and reckoning on 40% being hard camp and 10% being stone runs (this is a liberal estimate) the cost of this section would work out at :-

50% of $27\frac{1}{2}$ miles = $13\frac{3}{4}$ @ £1640 per mile = 22550. 0. 0

40% of $27\frac{1}{2}$ miles = 11 @ £1522. 13. 0 : = ⁶16749. 3. 0

10% of $27\frac{1}{2}$ miles = $2\frac{3}{4}$ @ £1200 per mile = 3300. 0. 0

$27\frac{1}{2}$ miles = £ 42599. 0. 0

/or

or an average of £1549. 1. 2 per mile.

Two cheaper kinds of tracks have been tried; one was constructed by forming two strips or ribbons each about two feet wide with flat rocks laid in the form of Crazy paving. This was done on the recommendation of the Hon G. J. Felton, a length of 150 yards run was laid down in the vicinity of Sapper Hill and it was tested but only stood up to approximately 100 vehicles passing over it, the slabs tilted and settled badly and many were thrown clear of the wheel tracks. The Hon G. Bonner and G. J. Felton inspected this and agreed it was a failure.

The second type laid down was known as the ribbon track which is referred to and illustrated in M.P. 258/32. I had seen an article in a journal describing this type and was at the time, of the opinion that it would suit conditions here, consequently in 1932 about one mile was laid down from the Common gate to Sapper Hill and it stood up very well for some months, but on the traffic to the peat bogs increasing consequent on the construction of the track it was found that the walls of the trenches which were formed in peat, gave way under the weight, with the result that the tracks spread and consequently settled. The centre portion was then dug out and filled in with rubble and the whole road strengthened. Thereafter track or road construction reverted to the orthodox method, that is by excavating the full width to solid and laying down a solid mattress etc, as previously explained.

C. Roberts.
Director of Public Works.
10th June, 1938.

Handed for H.E. the Governor 7/6/38 2.
" from D.P.W. 11/6/38 3.

Submitted by C.A. with a note on
road to Sapper Hill from - now extracted
~~with~~ 13/6

7/30

Sheet 4

H.C.

Mr. Roberts' excellent report will be the basis of a memorandum which I am preparing on the question of the policy of making roads through the camp. I would like connected files to be attached when this is returned.

Further information is necessary on the following points: -

(1) How is the difference accounted for between the £1400 per mile being the cost of the Campus track and the £1522 which is the estimated cost of a road over land camp.

(2). What is the average number in a year of full time working days paid for by Govt. in excess of actual requirements ~~as~~ as a result of the policy of finding work (part and whole time) to give employment.

The A. A. is in the best position to work out number (2). In order to make this more clear it may

I also wish to know exp. by Govt. on roads and bridges on private property and contribution made by owners.

be stated that the object is to ascertain the reply to the criticism that if the Agricultural Department was more mechanized a number of workers for whom employment is now found for a part or the whole of the year could be dispensed with and with no more expenditure they could be kept at work on the roads.

It is obvious that for road-making at a distance from Stanley it is essential that every man employed must be ^{physically} capable of putting in 45 hours steady work a week. The A.A. can possibly arrive at the reply with the greatest accuracy by taking ^{into consideration} every man on his list individually and separately and seeing how many of them with whom his Department could dispense when he has his machinery would be fit for road work and for how many months in the year. Two further factors are to be taken into consideration

- (a) The number when the sealing industry is in operation and when it is not and
- (b) The number that will be of able bodied men who can be dispensed with when Public Works are reduced from present numbers to sufficient for maintenance upkeep and minor works ~~and~~ i.e. works of which total cost amount to £1000 a year

141/6/30

D. P. Wks.

Will you kindly furnish the information called for in (1) of H.Q.'s minutes and in marginal note, also the information required under (b).

WCH.
14. 6. 38

Hon; Col Sec,

Submitted, with reference to (1) the difference in cost between the Canopus track and a road over hard camp of £114 per mile, is accounted for in the former case by not having to provide buildings for accomodation of the men, and by close proximity of the beach and ridges of rock to the site of the track, from which a certain amount of shingle and rock is obtained, necessitating less labour and transport than that required for work in open country over hard camp.

Marginal note on sheet 4.

During the last thirteen years the following expenditure has been incurred on roads and bridges on private property, as detailed overleaf, :--

Year.	Work.	Owner of land.	Cost to farmer.	Cost to Govt.	Remarks.
1925	Bridge over Murrel River.	F. I. Co.	10. 0. 0	55. 0. 0	£10 is for labour supplied by the Hon; G.J.Felton.
1928.	Malo River Bridge.	Hon G.J.Felton	Nil	1620. 0. 0	Work carried out entirely by Govt.
1928.	Chartres River Bridge.	Hon W.Luxton.	Nil	940. 0. 0	- do -
1932.	Swan Inlet Bridge	F. I. Co.	93.10.11	120. 0. 0	Work carried out by F. I. Co.
1932	Antiojo Bridge.	F. I. Co.	40.13. 1	60. 0. 0	- do -
1933.	Cutting track from Fitzroy to Mount Pleasant.	F. I. Co.	105. 0. 0	105. 0. 0	Work carried out by F. I. Co. £105 represents subsidy of half-cost of 15 miles @ £14 mile.
1934)	Fitzroy River Bridge.	F. I. Co.	400. 0. 0	400. 0. 0	Work carried out by F.I.Co, with second hand materials obtained from hulks in Stanley.
1935)			400. 0. 0	400. 0. 0	
1936.	Murrel River Bridge.	F. I. Co	Nil	200. 0. 0	Work carried out by Government.
1937.	Improvements to Estancia track.	F. I. Co.	Nil.	40. 0. 0	- do -
1938	- do -	F. I. Co.	Nil	100. 0. 0	- do -
Totals.			£ 1049. 4. 0	4040. 0. 0	

[2. With regard to (b) fourteen able bodied men is the maximum number that can be dispersed with when the Public Works are reduced from the present number, sufficient for maintenance, upkeep and minor works. A list of men required with details of their duties will be furnished in the near future with the draft estimate for 1939.]

E. Roberts
 Director of Public Works.
 16th June 1938.

Agri: Adviser.

In necessary action
please on para's (2) and
(a) of H's minute of
14.6.38.

met
C.S.
16, 6, 38

Hon Colonial Secretary,

I have the honour to submit, the use of surplus labour for road making would I think be governed considerably by when most of this labour would be available. The most suitable time, perhaps the only time when roadmaking could be carried on to advantage, is during the summer period from October to April, and it is during this period that whaling, farming, and other seasonal work absorb practically the whole of the able bodied labour.

This was so anyway during this period 1937/38, when the Agricultural Department's weekly employment list, exclusive of foreman and truck driver, averaged only sixteen, these all being more or less unfit for some reason for other work.

In April the whaling men returned and there is the usual influx of seasonal farm hands who have been dispensed with for the winter.

During the inclement period May/October this Department has to provide its greatest number of days employment, while the actual peak period is July / September.

By far the greatest part of the work provided by Government therefore has to be put in hand during the period which is most unprofitable to any employer of

of labour.

The assistance of machinery would not affect this Department's capacity for employing labour so long as money was available. Work would proceed more quickly, but large numbers could be kept busy planting tussac and sand grass, and on other improvement of lands in and around Stanley for some years to come.

Were it found to be of more advantage to the Colony to employ some of the surplus labour on roadmaking, this Department could most economically deal with its programme with twelve selected men in addition to foreman etc.

In the summer months however, the number of employed exceeds this only by four, and in most cases as has been said, the ones employed would not be worth much on roadmaking.

It is estimated that in the period May-October this year, this Department could dispense with an average number of thirty-five men besides the twelve already lent to the Public Works Department.

A total of forty-seven able bodied men who could be used for roadmaking in the Camp in winter time. This would amount to 6721 days of employment this year when the Sealing Company is not operating.

The Sealing Company, if working this year, would have used labour which we are having to employ, to the extent of 1600 days work, leaving 5121 days of employment available for road work.

I note that the Public Works Department may dispense with fourteen of its men at some future date and these would perhaps be suitable for road work also.

Stanley
Agricultural Adviser.
8th July, 1938.

Yi. Submitted In the past
 a good deal of road
 work has been done during
 the months of winter. In a
 normal season there is not a
 great deal of stoppage due
 to weather conditions.

met
 8.7.58

I wish to have 4 copies
 of Mr. Roberts' minutes of
 29. April, 10. June and 16. of
 June (except para 2). The copy
 should be headed 'Minutes by
 Director of Public Works a cost of
 Roadmaking in the Colony'. The
 dates of the minutes should be
 given in the margin of the copy

ttttt 16 July 58

Yi. Copies Submitted.
met

Will you please have two
 letters typed for my signature as in
 the draft attached. One should be
 addressed to Mr. George Bumer and the

other to Mr. Norman Cameron, Kitch

~~ttttt~~ 22/7/35

Letters to George Donner, Esq. and Hon. Norman Cameron of 25.7.38. 2-4.

~~Y.~~ Letters submitted.
met
ed.
26.7.38

Thanky-

~~ttttt~~ 30/7/35

Minute from W.P.W. of 19.9.38.

~~Y.~~ Report submitted.
met
ed.
21.9.38

~~ttttt~~ 21/9

Minute from W.P.W. of 24.10.38.

~~Y.~~ Submitted.
met
ed.
25.10.38

~~ttttt~~ 20/X

P.H.
30/7/38

(3)

see 118/38

P.H.
22.9.38

(5)

D.P. Wks.

Is the construction of the magazine at Sapper Hill proceeding? M.H.

C.S.
26. X. 58

How Bob Sec.

Excavating for the building has been going forward for the past week, the heavy rock encountered on the site necessitates a large amount of blasting & quarrying.

D. J. O'Connell.
SIC PWD Dept.
26/10/58.

B. U. 7. XI. 58
M.H. 27. X. 58

D.P. Wks.

How is the work proceeding?

M.H.
C.S.
7. XI. 58

How Bob Sec.

The required depth for the magazine has been blasted out & work on the base now going forward.

D. J. O'Connell.
12/11/58.

B. U. 7. XII. 58
M.H. 14. XI. 58

Letter from George Jenner, Esq. of 27. 10. 38.

6-8.

Yr.

Submitted.

Wm H

CS

23. 11. 58

(9-12.)

A letter from Mr. Felton is also put up. It seems to make out the best case possible but is of little assistance as he says that he knows nothing of finance and he is unable to counter the cut estimates. The fallacy that because roads have been made in or through sparsely populated countries elsewhere therefore it can be done here ignores the most important factors. There could best be illustrated by citing one actual parallel example. I cannot conceive of the existence of any ~~other~~ such parallel or an approximation to it. I admit at the same time that if a few hundred thousand pounds could be raised by economy in other directions or increased taxation it might benefit vastly the (80 to 90 per cent of the colony ^{who own} absentee landowners, and part of the benefit would ultimately accrue to the ~~Colony~~ general community.

Please return when Mr. Felton's letter has been rejected

Wm H 3/1/58

M

Letter registered and file returned.

M.H.
cl

5. 11. 38

M.H. 10/1/39

(14) Letter from Secretary, G.I.R.L. of 14/1/39.

M

Submitted. Apparently the League has no idea of the cost or where the money is to come from, at the rate of time taken over the Woody Valley and other roads it would take many years to reach Camp Stations.

M.H.
cl

19. 1. 39.

M.H. spoken. Send usual printed acknowledgment.

M.H.

20. 1. 39.

15. Letter to Secy, Reform League. 20/1/39.

B. U. 26. 1. 38
Incl. 20. 1. 38

Jh.

File returned.

Meth
C.S.

26. 1. 39.

With draft of letter for R.A.

~~11/11/39~~ 26/1/39

Jh.

Submitted in draft.

Meth
C.S.

27. 1. 39

Thanks. Letter to issue as

amended

~~11/11/39~~ 27/1/39

Letter to Secretary, F.I.R.L., of 27. 1. 39.

16-19.

Letter from Sec. G.I.R.L. of 18/4/39

G.V.
9/1/39.

(20)

In usual format.
Letter to Sec. G.I.R.L. of 28/4/39.

(21)

D. P. was.

In your observations please.

Meth
C.S.

28. 4. 39.

Hon Col Sec,

The average cost of existing camp roads is approx 18/6 yard run x 4 yards wide. At the commencement of these works it was necessary to have cook-house and sheds all of which were included in the cost of the roads.

2. The North Camp road is a good sample of Falklands ground, as clay, peat, swamp and rock was encountered on that section and it is on that road that I would base an estimate.

3. Knowing the work involved, transport necessary, replacement of machinery wear, losses by weather &c, I am confident that a road suitable for lorry traffic could not be made for less than 17/6 yard or approximately £1500 a mile, and then only if worked from a depot on the site, with Stanley as headquarters the cost would be considerably more on account of time lost on conveyance, morning and evening.

A. Lennon

O.i.c. Public Works Dept.

17/5/39.

M.

Submitted together with letter from Reform League. No doubt the work could be done cheaper by contract. This has been proved with peat cutting.

M.H.

20.5.39.

I do not wish the art of roadmaking to be lost as sometimes roads will come I suppose.

A sum can be set down provisionally in the 1940 Estimates for the construction of one mile of metalled road by contract

M.H. 20/5/39

Letter to Sec. G. I. R. L. of 22/5/39.

(22)

D.P. Wks.

To note.

MCH
C.S.

16. V. 59

Follow both Sec.

Notes, for inclusion in
1940 Estimates.

W.A.
23/07/39.

W.A.
25/07/39

Letter from Secretary, Stanley, S.C. 12/7/39 (23)

Yr. Submitted. Correspondence with the League on the subject of roads is in this file. With the present revenue there appears little hope of finding funds for roads unless by increased taxation. Provision for roads under Works Estuary had to be cut out to provide for the Agric. Dept.

MCH
C.S.

12.7.39.

Will you please reply that I will be very glad to meet ^{the} deputation at 11 oam on Tuesday next 18. inst

Meanwhile will you please have para 2 - 3 of the letter to the League excerpted and I wish by hand the deputation a copy of the Govt. case. And also send up

Please a similar excerpt as
marked for pgs 4-2 and a
copy of the reply of the Steamers
Association

13/7/39

P.S. I w'd like 2 copies of each
of the excerpts.

P.P.S. I also wish to know
the present mileage of roads in
and out of Stanley maintained by
the P.W.D. I am I think
right in saying that the Department
w'd like at least £3000 a year for
maintenance if possible

13/7/39

24. Letter to Rev. G.K. Lowe of 13. 7. 39.

O.C. P.W.D.

For information required
by H.R. please. I sent you
a note about this today.

McH
C.S.

14. 7. 39.

Hon; Col Sec,

There is 531 chains = approx 7 miles of surface dressed roads in Stanley, and 19½ miles of metalled roads leading outwards, comp:- North and South Camp roads and Surf Bay Rd 15¾ miles, roads on Common. 3½ miles.

~~J. J. ...~~
O.i.c P. W. Dept.
15/7/39.

J. J. Copies in duplicate herewith.
2. The Deputation will meet
J. J. at 11 a.m. tomorrow morning.

WCH
C.
17.7.39.

Thank you

The deputation were given the fullest possible information and a copy of the letter to the R. F. and that to the Sheep areas. They had no suggestions to make in face of it.

Mr. Bellman is preparing a write of the interview which will be sent to the S.M.C.

~~WCH~~ 18/7

Mr. Bellman, O.i.c. P. W. Dept.

Please file a copy of the notes herein in this paper.

WCH
C.
18.7.39.

Hon Col Sec.

Notes of interview in Lewisville

25-26.

J. J.
21/7/39

M.

Notes Submitted.

MCH

22.7.39.

In sending the note as amended will you please say that since the meeting the deputation my attention has been called to the cost of road making in England.

The Civil Engineers Cost Book (1931 Edition) lays down that the cost of making light roads on private estates is 6s. to 8s. per yards super. For a ¹²/₄ ft. road the cost is therefore ~~£~~ approximately £ 2,000 a mile. The cost of maintenance of roads in rural districts in the United Kingdom is £ 150 to £ 300 a mile per annum.

To complete the road to Estancia at a cost of £ 1500 a mile (or £ 1400 a mile below the estimate of Mr. Roberts) would cost ~~at~~ £ 18,000. ~~and to maintain it at £ 900 a year, if it could be maintained at ^{at} or half the lowest cost of maintenance in England.~~

MCH 26/7/39

Letter to Rev. G.K. Love of 25/7/39.

(26)

LP. Wks.

To note.

WCH
ed

25.7.39.

London Sec.

Notice
v.p.

26/7/39.

8a.
26/7/39.

Buzi/7/39
ed


From His Excellency the Governor

to the Honourable the Colonial Secretary.

There is I believe correspondence on file - possibly confidential - in addition to the paper you have sent me regarding the construction of tracks to the Camp. There was correspondence with the C.A. as the kind of road that would be suitable. I would like to see all of it.

2. I also wish to know the actual ~~total~~^{per mile} cost of the two roads (a) Whites Station to Two Sisters and (b) from the common path to the end of the motor road toward Fitzroy (c) the road now being constructed to the Canopus Hut.

3. (a) + (b) above were particularly costly I believe owing to labour difficulties at the time. The D. P. W. could probably say what the extension of these roads would cost per mile under present labour conditions. I wish to be informed of the distance remaining to be run to Fitzroy and the Estancia.

 7/4/38

(4)

GOVERNMENT HOUSE,

STANLEY,

25th July, 1938.

X

Two or three of the leading farmers, including yourself, have from time urged upon Government the desirability of constructing roads through the camp in the East and West Falklands.

The question of whether or not the Government should adopt a policy of road construction is dependent on the replies to the following questions to which I would ask in all courtesy specific answers and not vague generalisations:-

- (a) What are the precise advantages which would accrue to the Colony in return for the heavy expenditure entailed in building roads for passenger traffic ?

As no one has yet suggested heavy roads for freight now transported by sea, such roads are not under consideration.

- (b) How could the building of roads through privately owned property be financed ?

It is quite clear that the reply to (a) must detail advantages which will be commensurate with the expenditure, whether the returns are direct or indirect.

One of the difficulties in replying to the more or less severe criticisms ~~made~~ of the Government for not proceeding with road building is that the critics either ignore the question of expenditure or regard with scorn the estimates prepared by the qualified advisers of the Government.

There are now attached to this letter copies of three minutes from the Director of Public Works giving in/

George Bonner, Esq., O.B.E., J.P.,
The Hon. Norman Cameron, M.L.C., J.P.,

3

in detail estimates of cost based on the experience of many years. I am inclined to criticize the estimates personally but solely on the ground that the cost seems on the low side as it is little more than half that of motor roads constructed by other Colonial Governments in countries where labour is cheap.

The completion of the roads to the Estancia and to Darwin via Fitzroy may be taken as a criterion for consideration of the advisability of a road policy. The cost of the work would be not less than £100,000. The interest on this sum cannot be taken at less than £5000 a year and the cost of maintenance of the road after construction would be not less than 5% of the capital or a further £5000 a year. The total mileage of roads in the West Falklands alone to do equal justice to all would not on estimates of distance prepared by the Director of Public Works be less than 264 miles which could be made at a cost of £396,000, leaving the East Falklands untouched.

It may be argued that steady progress of a few miles each year would be justified - say ten miles at a cost of £15,000 a year. It has been suggested that the surplus labour in Stanley now employed by the Agricultural Department might be utilized for roadwork instead of being employed in extending the sand grass and tussac plantations in the neighbourhood of Stanley. The position of the labour market is that during the period from October to April, the only time when road-making can be carried on at any distance from Stanley to advantage, whaling, farming and other seasonal work absorb practically the whole of the able bodied labour available. X The extended use of machinery by the Agricultural Department would not have an appreciable effect/

X
mi

(2)

effect on the number of men, 12 to 16, employed in the summer season. In any event the total expenditure on the wages for surplus labour during the winter is not ordinarily more than £1600 in any year. *

incl

The question then remains as to how £10,000 to £15,000 could be found annually without additional taxation and what the concrete advantages to the community would be in return for the expenditure.

include

It has been suggested that the population of the camp generally - for whom the roads would be useless for riding - would benefit materially by the improvement in communications. Four directions in which such benefit would accrue have been mentioned :-

incl

- (a) Dairy and garden produce could be marketed in Stanley. The Town can of course raise its own products of this nature. They are at present in competition with imports from South America, when not raised for domestic use. It is at least doubtful whether the camp could compete unless imports were controlled and the cost of living increased.
- (b) Medical Services would be available more quickly. If that were the object one or two seaplanes would be far more economical than road building.
- (c) Education facilities for the camp children would be improved. This point is difficult to follow. Other countries with the same educational problem for scattered settlements have with all their roads found that education by correspondence shows the best results.
- (d) The minds of the people in the camp and their outlook would be broadened by better communications with Stanley. Few farmers would it may be allowed concede that any advantage would lie in this direction.

nt

No.
(It is requested that, in any reference to this minute, the above Number and the date may be quoted.)

MINUTE.

24th October, 1938.

From Officer-in-charge.
Public Works Dept.
Stanley, Falkland Islands.

To The Honourable,
Colonial Secretary.

(M.P. 76/38)

Hon; Colonial Secretary,

Submitted.

Magazine and embrasure.
Canopus gun site.

These works were completed on the 20th inst, cordite and shells are being placed in today, after which the keys will be passed to the O/C Defence Force

Road to Sapper Hill.

This road is now completed and some of the men engaged thereon have been released for whaling work.

The splinter-proof hut to accomodate gun's crew is nearing completion and should be ready for occupation in about one weeks time.

O.i.c Public Works Dept.

C/O The Falkland Islands Co.Ltd. (8)

61 Gracechurch St.

London. E.C.3

His Excellency,
Sir H.Henniker-Heaton K.C.M.G.
Falkland Islands.

27th Oct. 1938.

Dear Sir, "Road Construction East and West Falklands."

In further reply to your letter of the 25th. July, I have advocated "Track Construction" through the camp in the Islands for many years, not metalled roads.

By this I mean... General improvement of recognised tracks- by draining all swampy places or peat bogs and erecting small Bridges over streams, suitable for a light Motor Car to pass over.

I think the people who live in the Camps are entitled to this consideration from the Government, to enable them to travel about more easily and with less danger to themselves and the ponies on which they ride.

More especially when they are compelled to take long journeys, when streams are flooded and almost impassible, and the tracks are just one quagmire, through which these brave little ponies wend their weary way.

Those of us who have experienced these difficulties of travelling know what a relief it is to be able to say, towards the end of a long and difficult ride.. "We are all right now, there are bridges over most of the streams for the remainder of the journey; or, "there are no more bad passes to get thro'!"

The wonder is that the ponies do not break their legs or that the riders come through unscathed.

This is the experience of most shepherds and camp men whose work often necessitates them taking these risks.

(a)

Is there any further need to state what the advantage of a bridge or a decently made track would mean to the Colony ?

We do not want roads on which it is impossible to ride, and the metalled roads I saw in 1934-35 were too rough for any ordinary Motor Car and quite useless for riding purposes, as they would have lamed any horse in a few minutes.

(b)

The Track Construction through any parts of the Islands should be financed by the Government, as these tracks are for the general use of the people in the Colony and not for any particular Farm.

The present Annual Expenditure for the Colony is unnecessarily high, and should include a suitable estimated sum for track construction, without any further Taxation being needed.

The Sheep Farming Industry is the Backbone of the Colony and why should it be crippled by further Taxation;

The Estimates, for Road Construction, prepared by the Advisers to the Government are quite beyond consideration or the

capabilities of the Colony.

The benefits which would accrue from the improved Communications, would be, that those living in the outlying places would have some chance of an occasional change, which is almost impossible under present conditions, and they would also have the assurance that help could be obtained if required in cases of illness, and the possible necessity of being removed to the Hospital in Stanley.

It is only because the average Falkland Islander is a strong fellow, and lives a healthy life, that the Colony is, what it is, today.

I do not consider that the advantages should be commensurate with the expenditure in this case, as it is the duty of the Government to provide the convenience.

Education facilities, in my opinion are best served by a regular visiting Schoolmaster.

We may some day be able to have a seaplane, but not under present conditions, they can be very expensive hobbies.

I enclose a copy of a memorandum I received from Mr. Young, nobody else has replied to me.

I have the honour to be, Sir,

Your obedient servant,

Geo. Bonner

Copy.

Memorandum Re His Excellency's letter dated 25th. July, 1938.
addressed to G. Bonner. (6)

With reference to queries A. and B.

I see no advantages which would accrue to the Colony in return for the heavy expenditure entailed in building roads, and would do all in my power to oppose the expenditure of the large sums of money which would be required if it was seriously proposed to proceed with such a project.

The only road for which there might be some possible justification is one from Stanley to the nearest harbour in the Falkland Sound and so improve communications with the West Falklands but this too would be altogether too costly.

There can be no obligation on Government to build roads to any particular Station which principle must surely be common to all Governments. It is so obvious that I do not think it needs stressing

With reference to the possible benefits referred to on page 3 of His Excellency's letter.

- A. Stanley could raise all the dairy and garden produce it requires if it wished to do so.

A certain quantity is raised now and even if efforts were made to make the Colony self-supporting the additional quantity required is small.

I doubt whether Stanley could be kept supplied with Falkland Islands produce milk, butter and eggs all the year round at an economic price.

- B. Medical Services. I am strongly of opinion that a sea or air plane is the best solution of this question.

C. Educational Facilities. Even if roads were available, children would have to come into Stanley as boarders. This could be done with present means of transport but parents have shown no great interest in proposals of this nature.

D. This expression of opinion is too general. It requires amplifying and it can then be answered. I doubt exceedingly whether a case can be made out.

Finally, it must be remembered that all dwellers in the Falkland Islands including the Farmers and the Farm Workers live in an outpost, which fact is apt to be lost sight of. Both the Farmer and the Farm Worker derive some benefit from that fact and this surely must be offset against the lack of those amenities which are taken for granted in more sophisticated countries.

Signed.

L.W.H. Young.

London. 7th. October. 1938.

(12)

TEAL INLET,

16th November, 1938.

Dear Sir Herbert,

I thank you for your letter dated the 25th July, 1938, in connection with the construction of roads through the camp, which owing to my absence from the Colony and pressure of work since my return, I have been unable to reply to sooner.

I would now express my further views as follows:-

(a) Roads through the camp would mainly benefit the inhabitants in comfort and cheapness in travelling.

Stanley people who cannot afford a trip abroad, (which seems so necessary for Government Officials) would have a better opportunity of visiting the camp.

More children too would be enabled to have a change of surroundings which is proved so beneficial by the improvement in the few children who get to the camp for their summer holiday, - very likely much more useful than the Nutrition stunt.

A change would also be afforded to the workers and their families in the camp, which, I feel sure would be an inducement to men to work in the camps. The isolation of some farms, the difficulty and expense of moving

His Excellency

Sir Herbert Henniker-Heaton, K.C.M.G.

Government House,

Stanley.

moving is most certainly the cause of the difficulty in getting labour for the camp.

Camp roads are a need for the people as is shown in Stanley now by the number of cars and cycles in use on the few miles of existing roads. With more roads, cars would be imported by the hundred and practically every worker in the camp would be the proud possessor of a motor cycle.

Produce from the farms would improve the variety of foodstuffs in Stanley; Pork, Poultry, Geese, Lamb, Beef, Fish and Dairy Products would all be available.

Medical service would be easily available to the farms if the Doctors could travel in comfort. It is not so likely that ^{any one} ~~the farms~~ would be called upon to pay up to £100. for a vessel to take serious cases to Hospital.

Personally, I doubt whether Seaplanes would be more economical than roads.

Surely the humane treatment of farm workers in need of medical or surgical aid is worth considerable expense.

Were the roads extended; mails could be delivered quicker and fresh fruit would be easier to procure, which latter, according to the Senior Medical Officer, is an essential for health.

(b) I do not think the running of roads through any privately owned property would add to the cost. All owners would surely welcome a road, except, perhaps, the Falkland Islands Co.,Ltd. who would lose passenger fares and parcels freight, but as their charges are so exorbitant

exorbitant the more reason for the road.

Have the Falkland Islands Co.,Ltd. given any indication that they would object to a road through the Estancia camp? (I believe they have for a road to Darwin).

I don't suppose the roads can ever bring in revenue in any proportion to cost, but do roads ever in sparsely populated countries? Surely thousands of miles of roads are made in other parts of the world connecting villages which can bring in very little revenue.

Almost all large public works never do produce much in the way of revenue if put on a cash basis (vise Agricultural Department and Stanley Improvement Scheme), but are a return on taxes for the amenities of life which is a vital necessity in this Colony.

You say you are inclined to think that the cost of the roads built is low. I, personally, and many others, say it is extremely high as they were built by hand with the aid of one horse and cart and fit and unfit men who were not pretending to work, but just filling in time instead of drawing dole. (For instance; While Acting Governor, Mr J.M.Ellis went to see the men working and found them playing football with a tin. The game was not stopped during the time he was present and he dared not remonstrate with the men. One man was discharged for reading a newspaper behind a rock during working hours, but on threatening to 'punch the Boss's head' he was reinstated with and increase of wages at the rate of 1d. per hour.)

I do not admit we had man with sufficient knowledge of road building and he certainly could not handle men. I cannot, therefore, accept figures as to cost.

The roads under discussion are for car and passenger traffic and not for 30-cwt. lorries with loads. The Stanley roads were originally built directly on the peat and carried the ordinary cart traffic.

The minds of the people are already broadened by education, more particularly by wireless and travel and it is for this reason they are not content to be isolated on some of the out of the way farms without means of getting away, and you and I must admit we should be the same . I am of opinion that the labour question in the camp will become more acute and this not for any reason in connection with wages.

I do not know anything regarding the finance part of the question. I had an ^{idea} ~~aid~~ that the £50,000. odd shown as Surplus Balance meant something belonging to us as tax payers, but when I enquired at a meeting of the Sheep Owners Association in London if that amount could be spent on roads, I was told by the Chairman, Mr Bonner, that the £50,000. meant nothing and it was only figures on a piece of paper.

So, as I say, I know nothing about finance, but I do know that other Countries have roads and plenty of them, and that these Countries have not the resources at their command as has this Colony.

Yours sincerely,
(sgd.) G.J.Felton.

76/38

(14)

Stanley

14th January '39

Sir

The members of The F. I. Reform League desire me to acquaint His Excellency of their views regarding the Camp roads.

In the first place they consider it deplorable that these roads have been stopped after so much money being spent on them, when they could have been completed & a boon to the whole community; The coming Stock Show & exhibition would be more popular with Camp people if they could come by motor transport instead of suffering the discomfort of a sea voyage added to the greater cost of steamship rates.

The value of opening up the country by roads needs no stressing, or how the work would affect the unemployed

unemployed

And The members of The League ask His Excellency to Consider Their wishes in This matter & Commence The Camp roads in The near future So That when The men return from whelting work They need have no fears of being unemployed.

As Agricultural improvements & roads must go hand in hand it is suggested that Some of The money allotted to The Agri^l Department could be applied to new Camp roads & feet roads as well.

The Hon
Colonial Secretary
Stanley

I have The honor
to be Sir,
Your obedient Servant
W. J. M^r. Atkinson
Secretary

76/38.

27th January,

39.

Sir,

Red H.

I am directed to inform you with reference to your letter of the 14th instant on the subject of camp roads that His Excellency is glad to have the opportunity of removing certain misapprehensions which as shown in your letter, exist concerning the reasons for stopping the work and precluding continuance for the present.

2. The cost of the roads which have been made has been as follows :-

South Track, Common Gate to Pony's Pass, £1672 per mile

North Track, Wireless Station to Two Sister's Gate £1584 " "

3. The late Director of Public Works, whose experience of road making here forms the only reliable basis for estimates, supplied the figures shown below for costs of construction through each type of camp. There may be said to be three types through which road making has to be carried out :-

- (a) Soft Camp
- (b) Where clay is found within six inches of the surface
- (c) Stone runs.

Exclusive of the expenditure on bridges, on machinery and on portable quarters for the ganger and labour, the expenditure on (a) would be £1584 a mile (b) £1522 and

(c)/

The Secretary,
The Falkland Islands Reform League,
STANLEY.

(c) \$1200. Mr. Roberts considered that a fair estimate for the usual camp tracks in the East Falkland would be 50% of Soft Camp 40% of hard Camp and 10% of stone runs.

4. The Director of Public Works estimated that to complete the roads to Fitzroy (16 miles) and the Estancia (11½ miles) the cost would be \$42,599 made up as follows :-

50%	of 27½ miles	= 13½	© \$1640 per mile	= \$22,550
40%	" "	" = 11	© \$1522.13.	" = \$16,749
10%	" "	" = 2½	© \$1200	" " = \$ 3,300
			Total	<u>\$42,599</u>

The first figure includes the cost of small bridges, machinery and portable quarters. The latter would be available for all the work. The average cost for the roads would be \$1584 a mile.

5. The Government has not had anything like such a sum as that named for completion of the roads, at disposal. There would be no economic return whatever for the great expenditure involved. To utilize as suggested by the Reform League part of the money now spent on Agriculture for road making would scarcely help. The whole of the vote for labour for the Agricultural Department for the year would suffice for the addition of little more than a mile to each road.

6. There is the further point that the West Falklanders have complained and not without justification that Government spare funds have never been expended for works of use to them. Any road built should have as its terminus a port which could be reached via the Sound to bring West and East closer together. A road to Brenton Loch the nearest point would cost more than \$100,000.

7. There are people who decline to accept figures of cost such as those given herein and believe that

because

because a single car can move over hard camp or a scraped surface at a suitable time of the year the expenditure on a public road would be far less than £1500 to £1600 a mile. No one with any experience of the wear and tear and the effect of rains on a road sufficient even for light lorries and cars would support such an idea. It may be mentioned that a strong advocate of roads in the Falklands recently made an exhaustive examination into the costs of road making elsewhere. He formed the conclusion that it should be possible to construct a satisfactory type of road for £2000 a mile here though a service road for contractors over rocky and peaty ground in Perthshire cost £2500 a mile. He had no knowledge of the expenditure incurred on our roads. It would cost much more than £1584 to make a surfaced road like the Surf Bay road. Few cars would last long with regular running on the present camp roads.

8. It is not only the capital cost of construction that has to be considered but the maintenance charges. The cost of road making could only be met by expenditure from reserves. In addition to the capital outlay the loss of interest and the expenditure on maintenance, that is to say up to 10% in all of the original cost, would have to be made good annually. It is not suggested that there would be any economic return to the public from the construction of motor roads through the camp.

9. I am to state that His Excellency's view of the position is that it would be a great deal less expensive primarily and annually to maintain a passenger carrying seaplane service than to construct roads. The whole Colony would benefit from such a service and there is probably more prospect at present of such a service being established than of road development. No such enterprise could of course be contemplated while there are/

are any labourers for whom part time employment only is available.

10. I am to say in conclusion that the Governor would like the Reform League to realize that the whole policy of the Government for the past four years has been concentrated on finding how to increase the carrying capacity and productivity of the land, the sole source of wealth that exists in the country. It is an essential part of this policy that the workers should by increased employment and otherwise have a full share with other sections of the community in any benefits, if success results. The policy, right or wrong, does not as the League will agree, permit of large sums being diverted to other purposes such as road construction.

I am,

Sir,

Your obedient servant,

W. H. H.

Colonial Secretary.



Stanley
18th April '39

Sir

I am instructed to reply to your letter No. 76/38 of 27th Jan'y '39 concerning the question of Camp roads.

The members of the Reform League do not feel inclined to accept the figures of cost as given as many of them have been engaged on this work & believe roads could be made cheaper.

They respectfully suggest that a certain amount, say a mile or two of road should be given on contract as a practical proof of the cost.

The Hon
Colonial Secretary
Stanley

I have the honour
to be Sir
Your obedient servant
W. J. M. B. Atkinson
Secretary

76/38.

22nd May, 39.

Sir,

In continuation of my letter No. 76/38 of the 28th of April, 1939, I am directed to inform you that a sum will be set down provisionally in the 1940 Estimates for the construction of one mile of metalled road by contract.

I am,

Sir,

Your obedient servant,

M.H.

Colonial Secretary.

The Secretary,
Falkland Islands Reform League,
STANLEY.

Recd (21)

THE STANLEY MOTOR CLUB.

Christ Church Cathedral

Port Stanley Falkland Islands

REV GERALD K. LOWE

Secretary

July 12th, 1939

Honourable Sir:

The Executive Committee of the Stanley Motor Club have instructed me to write to you asking for an interview with His Excellency the Governor. The object of the interview is to discuss with His Excellency the possibilities of Extending the Camp roads.

Would you kindly let me know at your convenience if such an interview is possible,

Yours Faithfully,

Gerald K. Lowe

Secretary S.M.C.

The Honourable,
The Colonial Secretary.
Stanley.

76/38.

13th July,

39.

Reverend Sir,

Recd 23.

With reference to your letter of the 12th of July, 1939, I am directed by the Governor to inform you that His Excellency will be glad to meet the deputation from the Stanley Motor Club at Government House on Tuesday 18th July at 11 a.m.

I am,

Reverend Sir,

Your obedient servant,

MCH

Colonial Secretary.

The Reverend
G. K. Lowe,
Secretary,
Stanley Motor Club,
STANLEY.

76/38.

25th July, 39.

Reverend Sir,

I am directed by the Governor to transmit the accompanying copy of a note of the interview a deputation from your Club had with His Excellency on the 18th July, 1939.

2. I am to say that since meeting the deputation His Excellency's attention has been called to the cost of road making in England. The Civil Engineers Cost Book (1931 Edition) lays down that the cost of making light roads on private estates is 6s/- to 8s/- per yards super. For a 12 foot road the cost is therefore approximately £2,000 a mile. The cost of maintenance of roads in rural districts in the United Kingdom is £150 to £300 a mile per annum.

3. To complete the road to the Estancia at a cost of £1,500 a mile (or £140 a mile below the estimate of Mr. Roberts) would cost £18,000.

I am,

Reverend Sir,

Your obedient servant,

MCH

Colonial Secretary.

Rev. G. K. Lowe,
Secretary,
Stanley Motor Club,
STANLEY.

Note of interview by His Excellency the Governor to deputation of Stanley Motor Club at 11.0 a.m. on Tuesday the 18th July, 1939.

Deputation. The Revd. G. K. Lowe, Messrs: L. Sedgwick, J. McGill and E. Crawford.

Mr. McGill, the Vice-Chairman of the Motor Club, enquired whether the Government was considering the extension of roads to the camps, and stated that it was the opinion of the Motor Club that work should be resumed on extending the North Camp Road in preference to the Pony's Pass Road, which is considered of no importance regarding the opening up of traffic and communication with the majority of the farms.

His Excellency pointed out the impossibility of carrying roads further through the camps until such time as any benefit would accrue therefrom, either on the East or West Falklands, and acquainted the deputation with the capital costs of the roads already built here, also in other parts of the world with which he was familiar, and the amount required to maintain them. Details were given in extracts of a letter to the Reform League, a copy of which was handed to Mr. McGill.

Mr. Crawford was of the opinion that the costs of each of the camp roads was exceedingly high and felt confident that similar work could be turned out at a much lower figure, in which he was supported by the Revd. Lowe, who compared the cost of making up roads, equivalent to about £700 per mile, over virgin ground in Canada with that of the Falklands. He was informed by the Governor that similar work here, with surfacing cost about £630 a mile but that this was very different from road construction.

His Excellency furnished the deputation with a copy of a letter to G. Bonner, Esq., in 1938, replying to the suggestion of several farmers that the construction of roads to the camp should continue for the benefit of the camp population.

The apparently high cost of road making was it was explained owing to the following work necessary. The road should be sited where there is not more than one foot to eighteen inches of peat wherever possible. The top sod has to be removed, the subsoil well drained and drainage trenches cut on the high side of the road. A mattress of rock from eight to nine inches in thickness must be put on the clay: this should receive from three to four inches of broken stone or gravel: finally it should have a dressing of binding material and be consolidated with a ton roller.

The deputation was further informed that it was His Excellency's intention to make provision in 1940 as an experiment for one mile of road to be put out to contract, either as one or two separate works, which they felt certain would be readily accepted by local workers.

It was clearly understood that apart from the amount required for the maintenance of existing roads, no funds for the cost of continuous construction could be found without additional taxation.

The deputation thanked His Excellency and withdrew.
